RECOVERY ROADMAP: REBUILDING AMERICA WITH SKILLED WORKERS AND PREVAILING WAGE STANDARDS

May 20, 2020

Frank Manzo IV, MPP
Illinois Economic Policy Institute
Midwest Economic Policy Institute
fmanzo@illinoiseipi.org
www.illinoiseipi.org
www.midwestepi.org
FREQUENT AND RECENT MEPI CO-AUTHORS

Kevin Duncan, PhD  
Colorado State University-Pueblo  
Distinguished Professor of Economics

Robert Bruno, PhD  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
Director, Project for Middle Class Renewal

Peter Philips, PhD  
University of Utah  
Professor of Economics

Lameck Onsarigo, PhD  
Kent State University  
Professor of Construction Management

Lina Stepick, PhD  
University of Oregon  
Associate Research Faculty

Michael Kelsay, PhD  
University of Missouri-Kansas City  
Professor of Economics
CONSTRUCTION ESSENTIAL TO THE RECOVERY

- Construction deemed “essential” in 28 states, allowed in 21 others
- Construction and extraction: 18.9% unemployment (April 2020)
- University of Pennsylvania Wharton School of Business: During recessions, public infrastructure creates $2.20 in output for every $1 invested (2\textsuperscript{nd}-highest “bang for the buck”)


## Boosting the Economy and Creating Jobs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>$1 Billion Investment, Selected Infrastructure in the United States</th>
<th>Total Jobs</th>
<th>Direct Jobs</th>
<th>Multiplier</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transportation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance of Roads and Bridges</td>
<td>21,100</td>
<td>9,700</td>
<td>$1.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction of Roads and Bridges</td>
<td>12,000</td>
<td>4,700</td>
<td>$1.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Transit Systems</td>
<td>31,200</td>
<td>23,100</td>
<td>$1.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Airports and Air Transportation</td>
<td>8,100</td>
<td>2,400</td>
<td>$1.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Clean Energy and “Green” Infrastructure</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electric Power Generation: Nuclear</td>
<td>6,700</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>$1.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electric Power Generation: Solar</td>
<td>9,100</td>
<td>3,200</td>
<td>$1.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electric Power Generation: Wind</td>
<td>5,600</td>
<td>800</td>
<td>$1.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water and Sewer Infrastructure</td>
<td>11,200</td>
<td>3,700</td>
<td>$1.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Buildings</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Construction</td>
<td>14,900</td>
<td>7,100</td>
<td>$1.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction of Hospitals</td>
<td>14,000</td>
<td>6,300</td>
<td>$1.42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Iplan (2020). Job estimates rounded to the nearest hundred.*
BUT... WHAT ABOUT WORKER SAFETY?

The Boston Globe
Workers, advocates express safety concerns about reopening plan

The New York Times
Protecting Workers From Coronavirus: OSHA Leaves It to Employers

npr
Essential Workers Plan May Day Strikes; Others Demand End To COVID-19 Lockdowns
REBUILD AMERICA WITH: **PREVAILING WAGE**

1. Levels the playing field for contractors
2. Attracts and retains skilled workers and improves safety
3. Promotes ladders into the middle class
4. Provides great value for taxpayers
5. Builds quality infrastructure and strong communities
WHY DO PREVAILING WAGE LAWS EXIST?

Description: Local minimum wages for different types of skilled construction work on public construction projects

Purpose: To create a level playing field for contractors by ensuring that taxpayer dollars reflect local standards for compensation, craftsmanship, and safety
PREVAILING WAGE TAKES LABOR COSTS OUT OF THE EQUATION

\[
\text{Project Bid} = \text{Labor Costs} + \text{Quality} + \text{Materials} + \text{Fuels} + \text{Protective Equipment} + \text{Technology} + \text{Productivity} + \text{Management} + \text{Profit}
\]
PREVAILING WAGE LEVELS THE PLAYING FIELD

- Increases hiring of local contractors and local workers by 10%
- Keeps more tax dollars, more income, and more spending in the local community—creating jobs in all sectors of the economy

INDIANA EXAMPLE: Weakened prevailing wage (2012-2014) and then repealed prevailing wage (2015)
Monthly earnings:
- 14 KY counties: $610
- 13 IN counties: -$439
PREVAILING WAGE BOOSTS PRODUCTIVITY AND SAFETY

- Attracts, develops, and retains skilled workers
- Boosts enrollment in apprenticeship programs by 8%
- “80% of Contractors Report Difficulty Finding Qualified Craft Workers”
CONSTRUCTION IS NOT LOW-SKILLED WORK

Hours Required by Heavy and Civil Engineering Construction Apprenticeship Programs, Compared to Bachelor's Degree

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>On-the-Job Training (hours)</th>
<th>Classroom Training (hours)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Operators (4 yrs)</td>
<td>432</td>
<td>6,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heavy Equipment Technicians (5 yrs)</td>
<td>864</td>
<td>8,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction Building Inspectors (5 yrs)</td>
<td>794</td>
<td>6,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geothermal &amp; Well Drilling Operators (4 yrs)</td>
<td>472</td>
<td>6,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelors Degree, 120 Credits (4 yrs)</td>
<td>5,760</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Active apprentices in the United States, 2011-2018: +64%
PREVAILING WAGE IMPROVES WORKSITE SAFETY

On-the-job fatalities per 10,000 construction workers

- No prevailing wage: **1.81**
- Prevailing wage: **1.59**
- Difference: **+14%**
PREVAILING WAGE PROMOTES LADDERS INTO THE MIDDLE CLASS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>State</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Minnesota</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>+5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>+15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>+3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Indiana</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>+8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Ohio</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>+16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Kentucky</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>+10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>United States (*veterans)</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>+9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>+17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>New England states</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>+16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>+14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Indiana</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>+8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>+2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Kentucky</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>+6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>10 U.S. states</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>+3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>+3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**AVERAGE** +9%
PREVAILING WAGE EXPANDS HOME OWNERSHIP

PREVAILING WAGE PROMOTES THE AMERICAN DREAM

- Expands the construction worker homeownership rate by 2%, resulting in 61,000 more families owning homes
- Improves construction worker housing wealth by 13%
- Boosts property tax revenue by more than $500 million
PREVAILING WAGE INCREASES TAX REVENUES AND REDUCES RELIANCE ON SOCIAL SAFETY NET PROGRAMS

2016 National Study

- Construction health insurance coverage: +8%
- Construction retirement plan coverage: +4%
- Construction workers living in poverty: -3%
- Construction workers on SNAP food stamps: -3%
PREVAILING WAGE IS THE BEST VALUE FOR TAXPAYERS

- Use of skilled workers controls construction costs and ensures that projects are completed on time and safely.

- 76% of academic studies conducted since 2000: Prevailing wage has no impact on public construction costs.

- 93% of peer-reviewed studies: No effect on public school project costs.
WHY PREVAILING WAGE HAS NO EFFECT ON COSTS

✓ **Economic Census:** Labor costs account for just 23% of total construction costs

✓ Higher construction wages = contractors hire more skilled workers
"We got rid of prevailing wage and so far it hasn't saved a penny."

- Republican Indiana State Representative, Ed Soliday

**FACT:** Repeal has had no impact on school construction costs in northern Indiana.

REPEAL HAD NEGATIVE IMPACTS ON INDIANA

Blue-collar construction workers' wages decreased by 8.5% after repeal of Indiana's prevailing wage law.

Following repeal of Indiana's prevailing wage law, construction worker productivity growth was 5.3% slower than in Illinois, Ohio, & Michigan.

Wages have fallen for construction workers in West Virginia since repeal of prevailing wage.

Hourly wages have fallen up to 8% relative to neighboring states with prevailing wage laws.

Repealing prevailing wage has reduced apprenticeship training in West Virginia.

The number of registered apprentices has fallen by 28%.

Skilled construction workers who operate dangerous machinery, build roads and bridges, and ensure that schools are built safely should be paid a competitive wage.

68% of all voters support prevailing wage laws, including 55% of Republicans.

The U.S. Congress— with 58 Republicans in the House— voted in support of the federal Davis-Bacon Act in 2017.
PREVAILING WAGE IS NOT A RIGHT-LEFT ISSUE… IT IS A **RIGHT-WRONG** ISSUE

1. Levels the playing field and strengthens the economy
2. Attracts and retains skilled workers and improves safety
3. Promotes ladders into the middle class for all workers
4. Provides great value for taxpayers
5. Builds quality infrastructure and strong communities
APPRENTICESHIPS PRODUCE SKILLED, SAFE WORKERS

“Earn while they learn” without tuition costs and fees—$15,562 per year at Illinois’ public universities.

Through registered apprenticeships, “construction operates the largest privately-financed system of higher education in the country.” –University of Utah Economist Peter Philips, PhD

Messaging: Apprenticeships are the bachelor’s degrees of the construction industry, and are a great alternative to college.
APPRENTICESHIPS REQUIRE MORE TRAINING HOURS

**Hours of Apprenticeship Training vs. Minimum Requirements to Graduate from Public Institutions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Apprenticeship Program (Average for 2012-2016) or Public Institution (Requirement for 2018)</th>
<th>Hours of Training</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Joint Construction Programs</td>
<td>7,305.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employer-only Construction Programs</td>
<td>6,257.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Construction Programs</td>
<td>5,704.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Universities</td>
<td>5,760.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Colleges</td>
<td>2,880.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source(s): RAPIDS data for apprenticeships in Illinois between 2000 and 2016 by the Office of Apprenticeship at the U.S. Department of Labor; “Minimum Requirements for a Degree” at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign (UIUC, 2018) and community colleges (College Illinois, 2015).
COMPLETION RATES RIVAL COLLEGES

Graduation Rates of Universities, Colleges, and Apprenticeship Programs, 2000-2011 Enrolled Cohorts

Graduation Rate or Completion Rate

- Public Universities: 61.0%
- Not-for-Profit Institutions: 63.3%
- For-Profit Institutions: 43.2%
- Public Community Colleges: 65.6%
- Joint Construction Programs: 54.2%
- Employer-only Construction Programs: 31.5%
- Non-Construction Programs: 60.0%
APPRENTICESHIPS OFFER COMPETITIVE EARNINGS

Expected Pre-Tax Lifetime Earnings by Apprenticeship Program or Educational Attainment in Illinois

Expected Earnings by Age 60 for Apprenticeships and Degrees

- Associate's Degree
- Bachelor's Degree
- Advanced Degree
- Joint Construction Program
- Employer-Only Construction Program
Joint Labor-Management Apprenticeship Programs Are the Gold Standard

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Joint Construction Programs</th>
<th>Employer-Only Programs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Apprentices (2000-2016)</td>
<td>74,500</td>
<td>1,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Requirements</td>
<td>7,300 hours</td>
<td>6,300 hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completion Rate</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African American Completion</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Military Veteran Completion</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journeyworker Wage</td>
<td>$40 per hour</td>
<td>$23 per hour</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
JOINT LABOR-MANAGEMENT PROGRAMS ARE THE GOLD STANDARD

1. Present opportunities to “earn while they learn”
2. Are the largest privately-financed system of higher education
3. Award the bachelor’s degrees of the construction industry
4. Require more hours of training than four-year universities
5. Deliver competitive earnings that rival public universities
WINNING THE FIGHT FOR FAIR CONTRACTING

**Magic Words**
Build
Strong
Earn
Skills
Safety
Responsible
Quality
Standards

**Tragic Words**
Benefit
Help
Assist
Support
Unions
Regulations
THANK YOU!

www.illinoisepi.org
www.midwestepi.org
fmanzo@illinoisepi.org
708-375-1002

facebook.com/IllinoisEPI
Twitter: @IllinoisEPI